
Strategic Housing Market Assessment for the Northern Peninsula

TECHNICAL APPENDIX: SECTION 3

Led by the Housing Vision Consultancy



www.housingvision.co.uk

December 2008

Northern Peninsula: **Strategic Housing Market Assessment**

Strategic Housing Market Assessment for the Northern Peninsula

TECHNICAL APPENDIX: SECTION 3

Led by the Housing Vision Consultancy

Client Contact:

Pauline Warner
Regional and Strategic Planning Officer
Devon County Council
Lucombe House
County Hall
Topsham Road
Exeter EX2 4QW

01392 383012 (phone)
01392 382135 (fax)

pauline.warner@devon.gov.uk

Project Director:

Dr Richard Turkington
Director
The Housing Vision Consultancy
59 Stocks Lane
Newland
Malvern
Worcs
WR13 5AZ

01886 833118 (phone)
01886 830102 (phone/fax)
07714 106386 (mobile)

richardturkington@housingvision.co.uk

www.housingvision.co.uk

Authors:

Richard Turkington, Tim Brown, Sheila Camp, Frank Mason, Liz Millward Hayes and Debby Weller.

Additional Maps

Dotted Eyes and Bob Line

Produced By:

Date:

8 December 2008

Northern Peninsula: **Strategic Housing Market Assessment**

Technical Appendix 3: Contents

Appendix F	TABLES IDENTIFYING PATTERNS OF MIGRATION TO AND FROM EACH DISTRICT IN THE NORTHERN PENINSULA AREA FOR THE YEAR ENDING JUNE 2006	7
Appendix G	DISCUSSION PAPER: MIGRATION TO THE NORTHERN PENINSULA - TRENDS AND IMPLICATIONS	11
Appendix H	TREVONE CASE STUDY	24
Appendix I	EXAMPLE OF LOCAL HOUSING NEEDS SURVEYS: THE ANALYSIS OF HOUSING NEEDS FROM UPDATED SURVEYS IN THE PARISHES OF CUTCOMBE AND EXFORD	31

Northern Peninsula: **Strategic Housing Market Assessment**

APPENDIX F: TABLES IDENTIFYING PATTERNS OF MIGRATION TO AND FROM EACH DISTRICT IN THE NORTHERN PENINSULA AREA FOR THE YEAR ENDING JUNE 2006

The following tables serve two purposes:

- they identify the main population flows by local authority area. As there are entries for 375 local authorities, we have concentrated on movements in either direction of 50 people or more; and
- they consider the main moves in and out of the Northern Peninsula Districts by age cohort.

Table 1: main moves into and out of North Cornwall during the year ending June 2006, by age

LA	In					Total	Out					Net	
	0-15	16-24	25-44	45-64	65+		0-15	16-24	25-44	45-64	65+		
Bristol, City of UA	10	10	20	0	0	40	0	20	20	10	0	50	-10
Plymouth UA	30	40	50	20	10	150	30	40	80	20	10	190	-40
South Gloucestershire	20	0	20	10	10	60	0	10	10	0	-	20	+40
Caradon	70	40	100	50	20	280	50	40	80	80	40	280	-
Carrick	10	30	30	30	10	110	20	30	60	30	10	150	-40
Kerrier	10	10	30	20	0	70	10	10	30	20	10	90	-20
Restormel	130	90	190	80	30	520	90	90	190	90	50	520	-
East Devon	10	0	10	10	10	40	10	10	0	10	10	50	-10
Exeter	0	10	10	0	0	40	10	30	30	10	0	80	-40
Torrige	60	40	90	50	30	260	40	30	70	60	30	220	+40
West Devon	40	30	60	50	20	190	40	20	40	30	10	140	+50

(Source: NHSCR)

Key findings:

- The highest level of movement is with Caradon, Restormel and Torrige, with similar age profiles in either direction;

Northern Peninsula: **Strategic Housing Market Assessment**

- The main population gains are from South Gloucestershire, Torridge and West Devon, especially of families with children; and
- The main population losses are to Plymouth, Carrick and Exeter, especially of those aged 25-44 and of families with children.

Table 2: main moves into and out of North Devon during the year ending June 2006, by age

LA	In						Out						Net
	0-15	16-24	25-44	45-64	65+	Total	0-15	16-24	25-44	45-64	65+	Total	
Birmingham	20	10	20	10	10	70	20	10	10	0	-	50	+20
Bristol, City of UA	10	20	50	10	0	100	10	50	40	0	10	100	-
Plymouth UA	10	20	20	10	-	60	10	40	40	0	10	110	-50
Torbay UA	10	10	10	10	0	50	10	10	10	10	0	40	+10
East Devon	20	10	30	10	10	80	20	30	20	10	0	80	-
Exeter	10	20	30	10	0	70	10	50	40	10	10	110	-40
Mid Devon	40	20	60	40	20	180	30	30	70	40	20	200	-20
Teignbridge	20	0	20	10	0	50	10	10	10	10	0	40	-10
Torridge	110	80	210	90	50	530	110	80	220	130	60	600	-70
Sedgemoor	10	10	10	10	10	50	0	0	10	10	10	30	+20
Taunton Deane	20	10	30	10	0	70	10	10	20	20	0	60	+10
West Somerset	10	10	20	10	0	60	10	10	10	10	10	50	+1-

(Source: NHSCR)

Key findings:

- The highest level of movement takes place with Torridge and Mid-Devon, involving similar age profiles, and with Bristol and Plymouth, including more families with children;

Northern Peninsula: **Strategic Housing Market Assessment**

- Population gains are very limited, they are highest from Birmingham, including more older people, and Sedgemoor, including more families with children; and
- The main population losses are to Torridge, especially of middle age and older people; and to Plymouth and Exeter, especially of younger people.

Table 3: main moves into and out of Torridge during the year ending June 2006, by age

LA	In						Out						Net
	0-15	16-24	25-44	45-64	65+	All	0-15	16-24	25-44	45-64	65+	All	
Bristol, City of UA	10	10	20	10	0	50	0	20	20	0	-	40	+10
North Cornwall	40	30	70	60	30	220	60	40	90	50	30	260	-40
Restormel	10	0	20	10	10	50	10	0	0	-	-	10	+40
Exeter	20	10	30	10	0	80	0	30	10	10	0	60	+20
Mid Devon	30	10	30	20	10	100	20	10	40	10	10	90	+10
North Devon	110	80	220	130	60	600	110	80	210	90	50	530	+70
Teignbridge	10	0	10	10	0	40	10	10	10	20	0	50	-10
West Devon	20	10	40	20	10	100	20	10	50	20	10	120	-20

(Source: NHSCR)

Key findings:

- The highest level of movement takes place with North Devon and North Cornwall, with similar age profiles in either direction;
- Population gains are highest from North Devon and Restormel, especially of middle age and older people; and
- The main population loss is to North Cornwall, especially of families with children and younger people.

Table 4: main moves into and out of West Somerset during the year ending June 2006, by age

LA	In						Out						Net
	0-15	16-24	25-44	45-64	65+	All	0-15	16-24	25-44	45-64	65+	All	
Bristol, City of UA	10	10	20	20	0	70	0	20	20	10	-	50	+20
Mid Devon	10	20	20	20	10	70	0	0	10	10	0	20	+50
North Devon	10	10	10	10	10	50	10	10	20	10	0	60	-10
Sedgemoor	20	20	30	30	20	120	50	30	60	40	10	180	-60
South Somerset	0	10	10	10	10	50	10	10	20	10	0	60	-10
Taunton Deane	30	20	60	50	20	190	60	60	80	60	40	300	-110

(Source: NHSCR)

Key findings:

- The highest levels of population movement take place with Sedgemoor and Taunton Deane;
- Population gains are very limited, and are highest from Bristol, including more families with children; and
- West Somerset is exceptional in the extent of population loss, especially of younger people and families to Taunton Deane.

APPENDIX G: DISCUSSION PAPER: MIGRATION TO THE NORTHERN PENINSULA - TRENDS AND IMPLICATIONS

1. Introduction

1.1 It has already been identified that the Northern Peninsula Housing Market Area is experiencing significant net in-migration from other parts of the country, especially from London, the South East and the West Midlands. The following table summarises the outcome of migration to the Northern Peninsula area by age from the period 2002-6 and identifies the extent of in-migration by those in the middle age 45-64 and family age 25-44 age group, the latter often accompanied by children aged 15 and younger.

Table 1: patterns of migration with England and Wales by age by district for the Northern Peninsula area, 2002-06

Area	0-15	16-24	25-44	45-64	65+
North Cornwall	1,500	500	2,500	2,200	400
North Devon	1,600	800	1,900	1,600	100
Torridge	1,600	1,000	2,100	2,300	800
West Somerset	500	600	200	1,600	200
Northern Peninsula	5,200	2,900	6,700	7,700	1,500

(Source: NHSCR)

- 1.2 Whilst unaware of their ages, a further 2,230 non-UK nationals registered for work in the four districts in 2005-06, a near 1,000 increase on the previous year.
- 1.3 This discussion paper reviews the limited evidence explaining why people at different life stages, including international migrants, move to the Cornwall, Devon and Somerset areas including the Northern Peninsula and the implications for the housing system.
- 1.4 The data and information sources available are extremely limited and have been drawn from a variety of sources, from formal research projects to local blog sites; more robust research is urgently required. Quantitative data is primarily drawn from government statistics (see bibliography and reference list) and from scholarly work by respected researchers such as Tony Champion and Steve Wilcox. Both types of data source tend to be based on either county or regional statistics. Qualitative work in this area is even more difficult to find. The authors have drawn on local government published projects, research projects 'transferable' from comparable areas and more controversially, from wikis and blogs on the internet. These last are clearly labelled.

2. Younger Single People and Couples (16-24)

2.1 A combination of 'push' and 'pull' factors affect the migration of younger

people to and from the Northern Peninsula area. Push factors encourage young people to migrate from the area in search of education, employment and different lifestyles; pull factors, such as the 'arts scene' and proximity to the sea, encourage migration to the area in search of a better environment or lifestyle ('counter urbanisation'). Younger international migrants may come to the area for both opportunity and lifestyle reasons.

2.2 Young migrants in and out of the area are most likely to be:

- single;
- in professional/managerial occupations; and
- moving for work or to study.

"The migration of young adults is affected by the distribution of places in higher education and first jobs in the labour market"¹.

2.3 We don't know whether and when these migrants return, and it is likely that in other words, the young people who leave, and the young people who arrive are not the same people. Stockdale suggests that they usually don't, especially when they are from more disadvantaged areas, and have left to gain employment opportunities².

2.4 Young people who have not made the transition to independence are very dependent on their social, familial and geographical networks to get the contacts and information they need to make choices about employment, education and training (and even travel to work distances) "...wider social networks, positive role models and experience of and confidence in travelling outside the local area are all important factors in widening horizons... It is also important to acknowledge that the real limits and constraints of the labour market are more significant in peripheral areas than in central, well-connected locations"³.

2.5 Although it is not fair to say that 'those who get on get out', there is evidence of increased polarisation between those young adults who take advantage of further and higher education, and those who leave education at 16 or 17, risking bad jobs, low pay and unemployment⁴. We know that there are fewer higher education places in the area than elsewhere in England, and that there

¹ **Champion, T., Fotheringham, S., Rees, P., Boyle, P. & Stillwell, J.** (1998) *The Determinants of Migration Flows in England: a review of existing data and evidence: A report prepared for the Department of the Environment, Transport and the Regions* (DETR, Leeds University/University of Newcastle);

² Stockdale, A (2006) Migration: Pre-requisite for rural economic regeneration? In **Journal of Rural Studies**, Volume 22, Issue 3, July 2006, Pages 354-366, and see (v) below.

³ Green, A and White, R (2007) **Attachment to place: Social networks, mobility and prospects of young people**, York, Joseph Rowntree Foundation.

⁴ Jones, G (2002) **The youth divide: Diverging paths to adulthood**, York, York Publishing Services

are too few places for people to study part time, or whilst living at home⁵. The increased cost of University education, coupled with its dramatic expansion has led to more students studying in their local areas. This potentially builds the knowledge and skills of the population – but only if there are suitable jobs and affordable housing available on graduation.

Implications

- 2.6 The Northern Peninsula is a low wage area, severely restricting the housing options available for the young people who don't leave. The housing implications for most of this group are stark: without affordable housing either in their 'home' area, or where there are opportunities further afield, young people are effectively trapped living with their parents, their friends or in low cost private rental housing; few will be eligible for social housing. The high cost of housing may also prevent young people who have been away to gain education or training from returning to the area.
- 2.7 Further research is required to identify how people are housing themselves in the Northern Peninsula area.

3. International migrants (16-24)

- 3.1 Most international migrants are young, of working age and single.
- 3.2 Most come in order to work, often in low paid, seasonal industries and in social care. They are often overqualified for the work they do. A Joseph Rowntree Foundation study found that "Immigrants interviewed were well-educated (40 per cent arrived with a university degree, 33 per cent of men and 47 per cent of women) but were much more likely to be in low skilled jobs, whether compared to their own situation prior to departure, to long-term residents interviewed, or to the general population in the localities studied."⁶ The Northern Peninsula is well served by these industries, and the experience of international migrants is not dissimilar from UK migrants, who also took lower paid, lower status jobs as a consequence of migration (see elsewhere in this paper). The hospitality, tourism and social care industries are key employers for international migrants – many migrants find a job through their co-nationals, but most report that their employers are white British people.
- 3.3 Some of this employment will have been arranged prior to arriving in the UK, and may include housing. Many migrants report that their social contacts are

⁵ <http://www.cuc.ac.uk/about-cuc/why-was-cuc-created.htm> accessed 25/04/08.

⁶ Joseph Rowntree Foundation Findings no 2089: **East European immigration and community cohesion** accessed via jrf.org.uk on 28/04/08.

⁶ Ibid.

mostly with other migrants, possibly because of inadequate English. However, these are not insurmountable issues – migrants of the same nationality get together, and other migrants learn English, and integrate with the host community. In both cases, the sense of ‘belonging’ increases.⁷

- 3.4 Most migrants arrive with the intention of returning to their countries of origin – but a great many do not return. There is evidence that the generation who migrated to the UK in the post war period (roughly 1948-74) have not returned ‘home’, even though the UK government expected that they would – and although their labour was less necessary than it had been when they came.⁸
- 3.5 The longer people remain in the UK, the longer they are likely to stay. Once migrants have formed households or begun a family, they are far less likely to return home. The availability of low cost flights, email and telephone calls to countries of origin mean that migrants can easily stay in touch with their home country, particularly the ‘A8’ Accession Countries. Contact with the home country does not appear to lead migrants to be more likely to return there.
- 3.6 There is no relationship between how long migrants say they intend to stay, and how long they actually stay⁹. Research by Polish market researchers suggested that a great many Polish migrants plan to stay for at least 4 years, and many have no plans to return at all. The researchers noted that once a person had stayed for five years, it is less likely that they will return ‘home’ and that 40% of the sample in the research had already brought family members to live with them – again increasing their commitment to the UK.¹⁰

Implications

- 3.7 The vast majority of international migrants to the Northern Peninsula *do not* fall into any of the categories (e.g. asylum seekers) for which social rented housing is an option. It is possible to imagine circumstances where migrants may become entitled to social housing after a period of time, but there is no evidence that more than a very few lettings have been made to such migrants to date¹¹.
- 3.8 Most international migrants are dependent on housing provided by employers

⁷ Spencer, S, Ruhs, M, Anderson, B & Rogaly, B (2007) **Migrants lives beyond the workplace; the experiences of Central and East Europeans in the UK**, York, JRF.

and Robinson, D & Reeve, K (2006) **Neighbourhood experiences of new immigration: Reflections from the evidence base**, York, JRF.

⁸ White, P (2006) Migrant Populations Approaching Old Age: Prospects in Europe, *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* Vol. 32, No. 8, November 2006, pp 1283-1300.

⁹ Spencer, S, Ruhs, M, Anderson, B & Rogaly, B (2007) **Migrants lives beyond the workplace; the experiences of Central and East Europeans in the UK**, York, JRF.

¹⁰ thisislondon.co.uk (2007) Majority of Polish migrants arriving in Britain plan to stay permanently, published online on 5th July 2007.

¹¹ Robinson, D (2007) EU Accession State Migrants in Social Housing in England, in *People, Places and Policy Online*, 1/3, pp 98-111.

or the private rented sector which has a number of potentially serious implications:

- Migrants are in competition with each other, and with indigenous people for limited privately rented accommodation. An LSE study in London found that migrants form fewer households initially, preferring to save rent money by sharing rooms with co-nationals and other migrants. This means that initial pressure on the housing market is less than from the same number of indigenous people. The researchers assume that independent households will form in time – so that the pressure on the private rented market will increase in future¹². The pressure on the privately rented sector in the Northern Peninsula may already be greater than in London.
- Accommodation provided by employers is often in Houses in Multiple Occupation (HMO), and if this sector expands, local authorities have to expand the regulation they undertake.
- There is some evidence that international migrants are perceived as better tenants than indigenous people on benefits¹³.

3.9 Over time, international migrants (with some exceptions not currently migrating to the Northern Peninsula area) will tend to follow the tenure pattern of the rest of the population. Newly arrived young people who are looking for housing which is easy to access and provides easy mobility will turn to private renting. As settled households form, they look for more settled and secure housing. Migrants share all the problems of the rest of the population – high house prices and low wages. It is at this point that households may attempt to access social rented housing.

3.10 Because many migrants arrive in this country intending to return to their country of origin, it is difficult to plan for their future housing needs. Most migrants will stay, but that doesn't mean they will stay in this area as they are, by definition, a highly mobile group.

3.11 There is a need to monitor the rate of settlement of migrant workers in the area and the extent of family formation through Pupil Level Annual Schools' Census (PLASC) data, and the access of migrant workers to all forms of housing and to social housing through CORE data.

4. Families (adults aged 25-44) with School Age Children

Trends

¹² Christine Whitehead, 2007, **The impact of recent immigration on the London economy**, www.lse.ac.uk, accessed 28/3/08.

¹³ Residential Landlords Association, reported in Inside Housing, 19/4/07, accessed 28/3/08.

- 4.1 It is assumed that many of the family migrant households are headed by those aged in their 30s and early 40s, and these migrants move for a variety of reasons; to rejoin friends and family, to return to the area of their birth; to improve their quality of life¹⁴ or because of childhood holidays¹⁵. Sadly, there may also be an element of white flight¹⁶.

“I moved from Hampshire to North Devon in 2000 and moved back in 2001. I really didn't like it. We had many wonderful weekends there, and fell in love with the area so as our son was still young it made sense to move there”¹⁷

- 4.2 They may be taking a step up in status terms, by moving to the country, but risk taking a step down in economic terms¹⁸.
- 4.3 Younger members of the group are concerned about local schools, and about the range of schooling on offer. One (typical) enquirer asks:

“We are thinking of moving to north Cornwall and the only thing stopping us at the moment is primary schools. We just can't find any that are anywhere near the standard of our suburban primary school here in Bristol. Is the exchange of a more free lifestyle with a big garden and clean air good enough to swap for a lesser primary education?” (Vicki, Bristol Q10)¹⁹

- 4.4 With education in the region having (in general) a poor reputation, there is interest in alternatives, including home schooling. This may well be a big factor in decision-making pre-move. People also want amenities such as hospitals, doctors, libraries and shops, but are less worried about employment. Available information makes it clear that jobs are few and low paid²⁰.
- 4.5 The labour market is not the 'pull factor'. One member of a household may have a job to go to, but other members of the household find it difficult to obtain local jobs. Local wages are low, and much work is seasonal. The

¹⁴ **Champion, T., Fotheringham, S., Rees, P., Boyle, P. & Stillwell, J.** (op cit); **Burley, S.** (2004) *The Relationship Between In-migration and the Economy of Small Areas in Cornwall*, Paper to British Society of Population Studies conference, University of Leicester, 13-15 September 2004; and **Williams, M. & Champion, T.** (1998) Cornwall, Poverty and In-migration *Cornish Studies* Second Series No 6, pp118-26.

¹⁵ Champion, *op cit*, Burley, *op cit* and <http://www.Cornblogger.com>.

¹⁶ Ibid, and North Devon Journal 08-01-08 (on <http://www.thisisnorthdevon.co.uk>).

¹⁷ <http://www.digitalspy.co.uk/forums/showthread.php?p=20838519> – this blogger also says that there is an 'age gap' amongst residents, because people her age (20-40) have all left and won't return until their children have left home.

¹⁸ **Burley, S.** (2006) *In-migration to Cornwall: stepping off the treadmill?* Paper to British Society of Population Studies. University of Southampton from 18-20 September 2006.

¹⁹ <http://cornwall.backtalk.com/articles/2005/2/>.

²⁰ See for example: <http://www.positivelyilfracombe.co.uk/resources.htm>, a site developed to attract small businesses to the area. Local TECs make similar points, as do many of the bloggers.

partners of long distance commuters have the same problems. Seasonal work coincides with school holidays, which may rule it out.²¹

“This family moved both because they were looking for a change of pace – but ‘the location was the key’ they decided to move first, then started to look for work:

“Three months on from a break on the southwest coast [the family] were the proud owners of a post office. “We wanted to work for ourselves. We really wanted the lifestyle change...We came to Devon on holiday in May 2005 and just fell in love with the place.”

Not only have Darren and his wife got their shop off to a good start and are now living in one of the UK’s most sought after locations, the move has had a positive impact on their family life.”²²

- 4.6 The available jobs for migrants are not well paid although they include work in the expanding higher education sector²³. Advice to would-be migrants (from previous migrants) includes the need to be prepared to take lower status jobs.

“...there is not a lot to be had unless you are prepared to work in a factory. Food processing or manufacturing, supermarkets and care of the elderly are the main industries. Pay is very often set at the national minimum rate and even supervisory jobs are not good earners.”²⁴

- 4.7 Car use in rural areas is much higher than in urban areas, particularly for village dwellers. There is strong evidence that choice of place of residence is not related to place of work - people choose where to live, and then drive to where they need to work²⁵.

“North of the A30, central and north Devon, is definitely cheaper than to the south,” says David Berkeley of Stacks property search firm. Many of his clients look to north Devon after unsuccessful attempts to find good value homes on Dartmoor or in South Hams, which are now as dear as the Cotswolds.

That is the path being followed by Dominic and Henrietta Risebro and their five children aged one to 12. They are moving from Tunbridge Wells and are looking for a large family house with easy access to the towns of Lynton or Ilfracombe on the rugged north Devon coast”²⁶.

²¹ See above, plus Burley, S (2006).

²² <http://www.businesswings.co.uk/articles/Buying-a-post-office--Darren-Houghton>.

²³ Champion, *op cit*.

²⁴ Contributor to “Moving to Cornwall, 4x4 not required” <http://www.dooyoo.co.uk/real-estate-services/other-services-general-comments/1012230/> this contributor also says that most jobs are in the south of the county.

²⁵ **Land Use Consultants, SERRL & Delow, E.** (2004) The role of rural settlements as service centres: report prepared for the Countryside Agency (Bristol, LUC).

²⁶

- 4.8 One labour market factor which may apply to older members of this migrant group is the existence of armed forces bases²⁷. Housing is one of the major problems for people leaving the forces (see for example Joint Services Housing Advice Office²⁸), and until recently, most service people were not perceived as having a 'local connection' so were not able to access social housing easily. Having been posted to an attractive rural or seaside area, households may decide that they want to stay when they leave the forces – often earlier than the conventional retirement age. Ex-service families have essentially had 'tied accommodation' potentially leaving them homeless on leaving.

"Housing can be a real problem for those leaving the armed forces" said Lord Garden, a Liberal Democrat defence spokesman. "If they have been posted frequently, they may have few local links. In any case, house prices and long local authority waiting lists give them few options."²⁹

- 4.9 Anecdotally, service families may not start to think about post-service housing until much later than other households, reducing the time they are able to pay a mortgage. If they have chosen to settle in an area with higher than average house prices and low wages, they may face serious problems.

Implications

- 4.10 This is a migrant group largely dependent on home ownership. Whilst 20-39 is the main household forming age³⁰, the age of first household formation is rising³¹ suggesting that migrant family households dependent on an 'equity cushion' to finance their move will need to be over 30. This means that they are likely to be less well off in property terms³², and they are only able to move because the boom in property prices in London, the South East and to a lesser extent, in the West Midlands. This group has had to work hard to join the property ladder, they may well have a student debt and so will have saved less. But they are not moving from the low income areas, so we can assume they have been reasonably successful³³.
- 4.11 As the housing market starts to turn, this group may have less equity and will be less able to move, particularly as they may need two jobs to sustain a mortgage. They will be less able to absorb the costs of migration itself. On

²⁷ Champion, *op cit*.

²⁸ www.army.mod.uk/jshao.

²⁹ Norton-Taylor, R (2007) Army Families who quit forces left homeless, Guardian, Saturday January 6, 2007.

³⁰ Housing Vision (2007, unpublished) 'NP sub-regional HMA'.

³¹ Boswell and Millward Hayes *op cit*.

³² Boswell, C & Millward Hayes, L (2008, unpublished) "Where will we live when we are old" Getting beyond culturally sensitive care" Paper submitted to Housing Studies.

³³ Champion, *op cit*.

the other hand, a higher proportion of young people will have had to leave the region to go to university, because this region has fewer higher education places than every other part of the UK. This will boost the number of potential returnees in future years.

Predictions

- 4.12 Where household migration depends on an 'equity cushion' rather than on employment to finance the move, the rate of this type of migration will reduce as the property market slows down.

Transport links, including airports will affect in-migration, Exeter airport is close and expanding. Air fares within the UK make long distance travel affordable, migrants may not be commuting to work by air, but flying enables families to stay in touch. However, if air travel becomes more expensive, it could affect the willingness of people to migrate.

Much defence spending is moving to Wales which will certainly impact on Somerset³⁴.

- 4.13 There is a need to monitor the rate of in-migration from this group (through NHSCR data) in relation to property market trends (from Land Registry data).

5. Older Working Age Migrants and Early Retirees (45-64)

Trends

- 5.1 This group may be 'downsizing' following the recent property price boom, and may be choosing to work in lower paid or part-time employment, or to become self-employed. They may also be taking very early retirement (chosen unemployment). Self-employment may include 'semi-retirement business ventures'.³⁵ These people may not be adding to the wealth or employment opportunities of the region³⁶. Quality of life is the major motivation.
- 5.2 Some of these older migrants may have been second home owners who have sold their 'main' home or who have moved to the South West and kept a smaller home in a city as a base for work. More baby boomers have second

³⁴ Over the next few years, most, if not all, technical services training will move to the new Defence Training Academy to be sited at St Athan in South Wales. Existing training establishments, from all three services will close and re-locate.

³⁵ Burley, *op cit*.

³⁶ Because these are not businesses which employ people, they are self-employed individuals. Somerset TEC warns that there are a lot of very small businesses which take on young 'trainees', pay them in cash, then disappear.

homes than other population cohorts³⁷, partly because there are more of them, and partly because (at the top end) they are better off than any other group. Second home owners are often self-employed. Second homes in the region are often chosen without regard to access to local services because they are only needed for holidays. It has been argued that second home owners create employment and support some local services (shops etc), but not improve local public transport or schools³⁸. If some of this group become migrants, they are likely to be very car-dependent.

- 5.3 As a whole, retirees to the area are a cohort of more affluent people. There has been a tendency for people who can afford it to retire to the seaside and more recently to the country, and this has affected the South West region. These are the older 'baby boomers' who will become an increasing source of employment in health and social care³⁹.

Implications

- 5.4 These people are the younger 'baby boomers' (in their 40s and 50s)⁴⁰, and like most migrants, they are likely to be drawn from the most highly skilled and educated sections of the population. Because of their age, we can assume that they have been homeowners throughout the recent property price boom. They are at the age when they own their biggest, most expensive house, so if they decide to 'cash in', there should be an 'equity cushion' available.

Predictions

- 5.5 This group is likely to continue to migrate because property price differentials will stay the same even if the property market falls. If the property market falls, so will migration from this group, though not by as much as amongst younger households as these migrants will be cushioned by their equity. The rate of migration should slow down as potential migrants find it more difficult to sell their first home - assuming they are not moving to a second home.

³⁷ CCHR (2007) *op cit*.

³⁸ CCHR (2008), Rapid Evidence Assessment of the Research Literature on the Purchase and Use of 2nd Homes for the NHPAU, Leicester, CCHR; and **Simmons, M.** (1997) *Landscapes of Poverty: aspects of rural England in the late 1990s* (London, ACRE/Lemos and Crane).

³⁹ Somerset TEC, *op cit*.

⁴⁰ Boswell, C & Millward Hayes, L *op cit* The 'older baby boomers' – who are now retired – had a very long working life (school leaving age was earlier), and often an occupational pension. This (statistically) gives them a high income at state retirement age. They have also lived through three property booms. People born in the 1960s were ready to start work just as the 1980s recession began – delaying starting work for many. This means delaying household formation, and smaller savings over the lifetime.

- 5.6 There is a need to monitor the rate of in-migration from this group (through NHSCR data) in relation to property market trends (from Land Registry data).

6. Bibliography

Anon (2008) *The I'm-Not-Racist-But Crowd Will Not Change* 8 January 2008 [WWW] Available from <http://www.thisisnorthdevon.co.uk> [Accessed: 8.1.08].

Association of Public Health Observatories (2007) *Indicators of Public Health in the English Regions: Mental Health* (York, Association of Public Health Observatories).

Association of Public Health Observatories (2007) *Indicators of Public Health in the English Regions: Alcohol* (York, Association of Public Health Observatories).

Association of Public Health Observatories (undated) *People in England: Health Indicators, published with the help of the Department of Health* (York Association of Public Health Observatories).

Bate, R., Best, R. & Holmans, A. (eds) (2000) *On the move: The housing consequences of migration* (Bristol/York, Policy Press/Joseph Rowntree Foundation).

Boswell, C & Millward Hayes, L (2008, unpublished) "Where will we live when we are old? Getting beyond culturally sensitive care" Paper submitted to Housing Studies.

Burley, S. (2004) *The Relationship Between In-migration and the Economy of Small Areas in Cornwall*, Paper to British Society of Population Studies conference, University of Leicester, 13-15 September 2004.

Burley, S. (2006) *In-migration to Cornwall: stepping off the treadmill?* Paper to British Society of Population Studies. University of Southampton from 18-20 September 2006.

CCHR (2008), Rapid Evidence Assessment of the Research Literature on the Purchase and Use of 2nd Homes for the NHPAU, Leicester, CCHR.

Chadwick, D. (2006) *Business Survey 2005-6* (Wadebridge, North Cornwall District Council: Economic Development Unit).

Champion, C., Coombes, M., Raybould, S. & Wymer, C. (2007) *Migration and socioeconomic change: A 2001 Census analysis of Britain's larger cities* (Bristol/York, Policy Press/Joseph Rowntree Foundation).

Champion, T., Fotheringham, S., Rees, P., Boyle, P. & Stillwell, J. (1998) *The Determinants of Migration Flows in England: a review of existing data and evidence: A report prepared for the Department of the Environment, Transport and the Regions* (DETR, Leeds University/University of Newcastle).

Countryside Agency (2006) *Review of the value of the environment Countryside Agency* (from www.naturalengland.com).

Devon County Council (undated) *2001 Census Report* (unknown, Devon County Council).

Green, A and White, R (2007) *Attachment to place: Social networks, mobility and prospects of young people*, York, Joseph Rowntree Foundation.

Jones, G (2002) *The youth divide: Diverging paths to adulthood*, York, York Publishing Services.

Land Use Consultants, SERRL & Delow, E. (2004) *The role of rural settlements as service centres: report prepared for the Countryside Agency* (Bristol, LUC).

Little, A. D. (2004) *The State of the Key Sectors* (Cambridge, South West Regional Development Agency).

Miller, C., Cousins, L. & Tym, R. (2005) *The West Somerset Economy* (unknown, West Somerset District Council).

NHS South West (2008) *Older people in the South West have the highest life expectancy in England*, Press release (York, Association of Public Health Observatories).

North Cornwall District Council (undated) *Homelessness Action Plan* (Wadebridge, North Cornwall District Council).

North Cornwall District Council (undated) *Report on 2001 Census, Industry and Occupation* (Wadebridge, North Cornwall District Council: Forward Planning).

North Cornwall District Council (undated) *Report on 2001 Census, Education* (Wadebridge: North Cornwall District Council: Forward Planning).

North Cornwall Local Strategic Partnership (2006) *Minutes of Meeting held on 9th November 2006, Committee Room* (Wadebridge, North Cornwall District Council).

Office for National Statistics (2008) *Social Trends: population and migration statistics* (London, ONS).

Northern Peninsula: **Strategic Housing Market Assessment**

Palmer, G., North, J., Carr, J. & Kenway, P. (2003) *Monitoring poverty and social exclusion 2003* (York, Joseph Rowntree Foundation Services).

Robinson, D & Reeve, K. (2006) *Neighbourhood experiences of new immigration: Reflections from the evidence base*, York, JRF.

Simmons, M. (1997) *Landscapes – of Poverty: aspects of rural England in the late 1990s* (London, ACRE/ Lemos and Crane).

Somerset Strategic Partnership (2003) *Community Profile* (unknown, Somerset Strategic Partnership).

Spencer, S., Ruhs, M., Anderson, B. & Rogaly, B. (2007) *Migrants lives beyond the workplace; the experiences of Central and East Europeans in the UK*, York, JRF.

Stockdale, A. (2006) Migration: Pre-requisite for rural economic regeneration? In *Journal of Rural Studies*, Volume 22, Issue 3, July 2006, Pages 354-366.

Storey, P. & Brannen, J. (2000) *Young People and Transport in Rural Areas* (York, Joseph Rowntree Foundation Findings).

White, P. (2006) Migrant Populations Approaching Old Age: Prospects in Europe, *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* Vol. 32, No. 8, November 2006, pp 1283-1300.

Wilcox, S. (2003) *League tables reveal the least affordable areas for young homebuyers in South West* (York, Joseph Rowntree Foundation Findings).

Williams, M. & Champion, T. (1998) Cornwall, poverty and in-migration *Cornish Studies* Second Series, No 6, pp118-26.

7. Web Sites: by County

Cornwall

<http://cornwall.backtalk.com/articles/2005/2/>

<http://cornwall.backtalk.com/articles/category/cornwall/>

<http://cornwall.backtalk.com/photos/cornwall/>

<http://cornblogger.com/10-reasons-to-move-to-cornwall>

<http://cornblogger.com/10-reasons-to-move-to-cornwall>

Northern Peninsula: **Strategic Housing Market Assessment**

<http://cornblogger.com/15-countryside-hazards#more-26>

<http://cornblogger.com/>

<http://www.dooyoo.co.uk/real-estate-services/other-services-general-comments/1012230/>

<http://clearharmony.net/articles/200710/41630.html>

<http://uk.answers.yahoo.com/question/index?qid=20060904061548AAxgsh9>

<http://www.cornwallpurebusiness.co.uk/success-stories/ict-and-media/business-cornwall.htm>

<http://www.ncdc.gov.uk/index.cfm?articleid=19419>

<http://www.ncdc.gov.uk/index.cfm?articleid=846>

Devon

<http://www.gumtree.com/london/50/18738350.html>

<http://www.clickajob.co.uk/vacancies/aupair-couple-wanted-for-london-family-moving-to-north-devon--9598732.html>

<http://www.digitalspy.co.uk/forums/showthread.php?p=20838519>

<http://www.digitalspy.co.uk/forums/showthread.php?s=c80c8e34ae394de9a4041810437bce06&t=729052&page=2>

<http://www.bbc.co.uk/devon/news/102001/23/homes.shtml>

http://www.devon.gov.uk/es/census_2001.htm

<http://www.thisisnorthdevon.co.uk/displayNode.jsp?nodeId=198348&command=displayContent&sourceNode=198336&contentPK=19673414&moduleName=InternalSearch&formname=sidebarsearch>

Somerset

<http://www.criernews.blogspot.com/>

http://www.thisisthewestcountry.co.uk/display.var.1265098.0.broomfield_buy_for_johnny_depp.php

<http://earthcallingsomerset.co.uk/step/workexp/wholepic/westsome.htm>

Northern Peninsula: **Strategic Housing Market Assessment**

<http://earthcallingsomerset.co.uk/step/workexp/factfile/health.htm#employ>

APPENDIX H: TREVONE CASE STUDY

Although originally planned as a focus group, advice from one of the contacts in the area was that this approach may not be best as people would be unwilling to discuss their circumstances while others were present. Consequently, face to face interviews have been undertaken with:

- A long term resident who was initially a second home owner;
- A recent resident who was initially a second home owner;
- A resident running local 'change over/caretaking' business;
- A local resident and owner of holiday apartments;
- A young resident making use of a 'winter let'; and
- A telephone interview with a hotel manager in Padstow.

The outcome of the interviews is reviewed in detail below but the headlines are as follows:

- There is no clear divide between what is a second home and what is a holiday home;
- Some new build is specifically aimed at the second home market;
- Some holiday accommodation is let to those living locally during the winter;
- It is quite common to have a holiday home and then move down to live in the area;
- Some second home owners integrate with the community but this may be the exception rather than the rule;
- A number of businesses in and around Trevone rely on the second and holiday homes market;
- Some of the hotels and restaurants provide their own accommodation for workers; and
- Those letting in the winter often move into a caravan for the summer.

The prevalence of second and holiday homes

Those interviewed estimated that there are around 300 homes in Trevone of which around 70% (between 60% to 80%) are second and holiday homes. There is no clear divide between what is a second home and what is a holiday home. Some are used entirely for the holiday market; others are very much a second family home. There are very few that are not let out to others at all. There are some that are on long lets, but people often don't let them for long periods as they want to be able to use them themselves. The number of second homes has increased over the last few years. People have been taking the opportunity to infill and it was estimated that there have been 20 new homes built in the last five years.

Some new build has taken place specifically for the second home market. Recently, a bungalow was demolished and replaced by two apartments that sleep four and six people; the six bed sold for between £700,000 and £800,000. It was bought by a couple with two children and it is planned that in time it will become their main residence.

There has always been quite a high proportion of holiday homes in the area, and those on the seafront have always been holiday homes. However, the tourist market has changed, for example, what was Greenways Hotel is now high value holiday apartments.

It is estimated that around 20 of the second/holiday homes are owned by local people, and a local family owns seven self catering apartments. The property had been in the family since 1938, originally as a small bungalow owned by the owner's grandparents. It had a second floor put on and was run as a guesthouse but was later converted into apartments. The current owners used to live in one of the apartments but have now built a house on a plot of land next door. The apartments are let for holiday use during the summer from May till October. Some are let to those living locally during the winter. Over the last winter, three have been let in this way, two are having work completed and no-one has approached to rent the other two. Generally those in their early twenties take the winter lets, usually young couples. They often work in the tourist industry in hotels and restaurants in Padstow although one of the current residents is a teacher in Newquay. Some of the winter lets go to locals and others go to those who have moved down. One resident works in the surf school here in the summer and at a ski school in France in the winter.

Holiday/second homes in other local villages

Other places in the vicinity have different levels of second/holiday home ownership, for example Rock and Constantine have a higher proportion; the former of second and the latter of holiday homes.

“Constantine is dead outside May/June/July/August. It has no soul and no community. Everyone is over 50. It has a village shop but no pub”.

Views on whether or not there should be constraints on the supply of second and holiday homes

The consensus was that there should be some constraints on the number of homes people own including increased Council Tax and Stamp Duty. Local people don't feel they have a say in local planning matters although they don't mind new build if the whole infrastructure is taken into account including the sewerage, road and parking capacity. Only one road in Trevone is a public highway, the rest being unadopted roads and there were concerns about who would pay when they needed repair. Residents didn't think that villages should be expanded without the infrastructure to support it.

How much of the year are second and holiday homes used for?

Holiday patterns have changed; ten years ago Padstow would be deserted by the end of September but now the season runs from the 1 April through to the 1 November, and includes Christmas and the New Year as well. People take more holidays than they used to; often their main holiday is abroad and they go there for long breaks. The way they book has also changed; there are a lot more last minute bookings and there are more holiday makers there when major catastrophes occur which put them off going abroad. Some second home owners come every school holiday although sometimes they will come a lot initially but then it starts to wear off.

People who "move down" to the area

It was thought quite common for people to have a holiday home and then move down more permanently as changing working patterns now allow that to happen. There are some families who have moved in as they want to escape the 'rat race'.

When people move down, they tend to stay; those interviewed couldn't recall anybody who had moved down and then gone back again although this was partly contradicted by one of the couples interviewed. Those who move down do a variety of work - teachers, cleaners and caretakers for the second homes, run bed and breakfasts and guesthouses; there's a paramedic and physiotherapist and a website designer who works half from home and half in the office. Some who move from London work part from there and then go back periodically for a few days. A couple who moved from Birmingham built a German kit home, which is technologically brilliant. They now live there and work from home a lot.

Second home owners' involvement with the local community

The interviewees considered that there was still a good community in Trevone and that "everyone knows everyone". They considered that some second home owners do integrate with the community as they have children and want them to feel that it is a second home for them. These owners are committed to the place. One of the couples now had their main home in Trevone, but had only made this change recently and had spent many years as second home owners. They had made a lot

of effort to become involved with the community, supporting community projects, going to coffee mornings, being involved with the local church, using the local shops and post office and buying farm produce, etc. They also baked cakes for community functions and participated in the local pub quiz. They were well known by others and clearly thought of as part of the community.

Second home owners aren't what they used to be!

It was however thought that the type of second home owners was changing. This was related to the 'Padstow effect' which encourages very wealthy, acquisitive people who don't want to mingle. Second home owners and those coming on holiday were increasingly the 'Chelsea brigade' who arrive in 'four wheel drive cars' and don't want to be involved with coffee mornings and the like. They have their own circle of friends who come down and don't want to mix with the locals and have no consideration for other people.

"People say they love the area but they don't respect it. They throw all sorts of rubbish out so there's extra refuse collection. They would rather put in the waste bin than pay for it to be collected. They leave their lights on, they drive in the middle of the road. It's a huge drain on local resources including doctors and paramedics. They go to get treated for sunburn and lifeboats get called out because they have no sea sense. Two years ago someone was drowned because he kept standing at the end of the cliffs waiting for the waves to hit him. Locals had been telling him for three days not to do it because it was dangerous. Holiday dogs aren't properly trained and they pick the dog's poo up in a carrier bag then chuck the bag in the hedge."

The view was that there are still traditional values in Trevone, but they're not as strong as they were.

The impact on the economy

Tourism is a big part of the Cornish economy and many of those living in Trevone are involved with the tourist industry in one way or another. Most people in the village work in the holiday trade and make their money during the summer. Schools even allow children to take time out to allow for holidays where their parents are working during the holiday season. The population of Cornwall in general increases hugely during the summer. Tourists do spend in the village and use the farms shops and some shops wouldn't be there if it wasn't for holiday homes.

It is also clear that a number of businesses in and around Trevone rely specifically on the second and holiday homes market which increases the revenue coming in to the area. For example, there is a business which handles the change overs; gets properties ready for new occupants, looks after them during the summer and keep a check on them during the winter month. Local estate agents put purchasers of second homes in touch with local people such as plumbers, builders, electricians and decorators, and those handling change overs and the local laundry. A local

builder has lived in the area for ten years and only twice worked outside of Trevone; bookings are assured for 18 months ahead. There are still a visiting butcher and fish monger who also benefit; even local advertisers and printers are used. Second and holiday home owners may use local services even if they are more expensive. A firm in St Austell is used to fit properties out with domestic appliances and a local carpet fitter is available. They also help to support the village shop which provides guests with a list of what it sells and arranges deliveries. Some of the guests hardly use their kitchens at all as they eat out every day. Some property owners provide guests with a welcome hamper of local produce – bread, jam, herbs, etc and details of local restaurants.

Issues related to the housing market in the area

It was acknowledged that affordability was a very real issue in the area. Local people cannot afford to buy and properties are generally not available to rent on a long term basis as more money can be made letting them to tourists. For example, a bungalow right on the coast sleeps up to eight people and is let for £1,200 a week during the peak season in the summer. Over the Christmas and New Year period it will draw in £1,000 over a weekend.

There are sometimes long lets for six months which are let weekly during the summer. Those letting properties in the winter often move into a caravan for the summer or sometimes they have to move away. The number of children in Trevone is increasing now as those moving in are aged in their 30s and have children. Estimates of the number of children permanently living in the village ranged from 35 to 55.

Concluding remarks

It is clear that whilst second and holiday home have long been a feature of Trevone, their number and impact has increased. Although Trevone still has some community spirit, it is being challenged and other areas are known not to have fared so well. The residents in and around Trevone have been entrepreneurial in their approach to second homes and at a local level the second homes now form part of the economy and help to sustain a number of business. This is however small scale and localised. The key question is to what extent the positive contribution to the local economy counterbalances the potentially negative impact on local housing choice. If current trends continue, it is highly unlikely that local families will be able to purchase homes for sale in Trevone in the future and the proportion of second home ownership will grow still further. Similar pressures are likely to be present in other second home hot spots.

APPENDIX I: EXAMPLE OF LOCAL HOUSING NEEDS SURVEYS -THE ANALYSIS OF HOUSING NEEDS FROM UPDATED SURVEYS IN THE PARISHES OF CUTCOMBE AND EXFORD

Introduction

Full Housing Needs Surveys were undertaken by the Exmoor, North Devon and West Somerset Rural Housing Project in Exford (2003) and Cutcombe (2005). In Exford, the survey identified 9 households in need and in Cutcombe, the figure was 16, although there were 9 other households with strong connections to the Parish. At the point at which housing projects could be delivered, the assessment of housing need was reviewed and the overall outcome is as follows.

Exford

As this survey was 4 years old, a short questionnaire was circulated to everyone in the Parish, to be returned by those in housing need. 20 were returned, 17 of which identified the following households in housing need:

- 8 x single young people;
- 2 x single older people (1 prefers not to live in Exford, the other may be best moving closer to family-Bishops Nympton);
- 2 x couples;
- 1 x family with 1 child;
- 3 x family with 2 children; and
- 1 x family with 3 children.

Cutcombe

The survey had been undertaken relatively recent, it had involved additional networking with Parish Council members and had produced a much higher response rate than was typical. It was felt in this case that it would be more appropriate to re-contact all those who had been identified as in housing need from the original survey. Of the 25 households identified, 5 had not yet been contacted and 5 had managed to meet their housing need through either low cost self-build projects or by buying on the open market. The following households in housing need were confirmed:

- 8 x single young people (2 also included in Exford figures);
- 3 x couples;
- 1 x family with 1 child;
- 2 x family with 2 children; and
- 1 x family with 4 children.

Those not yet contacted but identified in the original survey as in housing need consisted of:

- 4 x single young people; and

Northern Peninsula: **Strategic Housing Market Assessment**

- 1 x family with 6 children.

Housing preferences

Households from both surveys were asked where they would prefer to live. Several provided multiple answers, including Parishes outside the immediate area. The responses have been used to calculate the accommodation required in each Parish, based on the assumption of meeting 75% of need.

Table 1: housing requirements by property size and location

Household type	Number	Prefer Exford	Prefer Cutcombe	Prefer Simonsbath	Prefer Winsford
2 bed homes					
Single younger people	14	9	11	5	
Single older or disabled people	2 (one prefers to relocate off Exmoor)		1		
Couples	5	2	3		2
Totals	21	11	15	5	2
Proportion in each Parish	100%	33.3%	45.5%	15%	6%
Recommended no. of homes (75% of total housing need)	16	6	7	2	1
3 bed homes					
Family with 1 child	2	1	2	1	
Family with 2 children	5	4	3		1
Totals	7	5	5	1	1
Proportion in each Parish	100%	42%	42%	8%	8%
Recommended no. homes (75% of total housing need)	5	2	2	0	1
4 bed homes					
Family with 3 children	1	1			
Family with 4+ children	2		2		1
Totals	3	1	2		1
Recommended no. homes (100% of total housing need)	3	1	2	0	0

Affordable renting or low cost home ownership

Virtually all the respondents aspired to buy at least some equity in their home. However, with most equity shares at £80k+, a gross household income of £23k or more would be required to service the mortgage. On that basis, the following households could afford low cost home ownership:

- 4 x single young people;

Northern Peninsula: **Strategic Housing Market Assessment**

- 1 x single older person;
- 1 x couple;
- 1 x family with 2 children; and
- 1 x family with 3 children.

Summary of recommendations

The following table takes account of those able to afford low cost home ownership to provide an overview of the affordable housing requirement arising from the initial and subsequent surveys.

Table 2: affordable housing required by size and location

Size	Number	Exford	Cutcombe	Simonsbath	Winsford
2 bedrooms	16	6	7	2	1
	(6 low cost home ownership)	(2)	(3)	(1)	
3 bedrooms	5	2	2	0	1
	(1 low cost home ownership)		(1)		
4/5 bedrooms	3	1	2	0	0
	(1 low cost home ownership)	(1)			
Totals	24	9	11	2	2